

MINUTES  
JOINT MEETING  
**HOUSE EDUCATION COMMITTEE  
SENATE EDUCATION COMMITTEE**

**DATE:** Monday, January 30, 2017

**TIME:** 3:00 P.M.

**PLACE:** EW42

**MEMBERS:** Chairman VanOrden, Vice Chairman McDonald, Representatives Shepherd, Boyle, Clow, Mendive (Mendive), Kerby, Cheatham, Amador, DeMordaunt, Moon, Syme, Kloc, McCrostie, Toone

Chairman Mortimer, Vice Chairman Thayn, Senators Winder, Nonini, Den Hartog, Guthrie, Crabtree, Buckner-Webb, Ward-Engelking

**ABSENT/  
EXCUSED:** None

**GUESTS:** Vikki Reynolds, Dale Kleinert, Northwest Credit Association/AdvancED; Anthony Warn, Bluum; Tim Hill, Idaho State Department of Education; Tanner Beymer, Coalition of Idaho Charter School Families; Michele Carreras, Idaho Public Safety Communications Commission; Kevin Haight, PSAP Standards and Training.

**Chairman Mortimer** called the meeting to order at 3:01 pm.

**Rep. Wendy Horman** introduced **Dr. Marguerite Roza**, Research Professor, Director, Edunomics Lab, Georgetown University. Ms. Roza presented "What New Research Implies for State Education Finance Policy."

**Dr. Roza** stated that by working on productivity, greater outcomes can be expected from students. According to her research, there is not much of a relationship between spending and productivity outcomes. But, in terms of productivity, research can be done on what schools are spending money on. However, expenditure choices only explain a small amount of the variation. A large portion of the variation is based on human variables. The question arises of whether or not fiscal policy makers should ignore these human variables or not.

As an example, **Dr. Roza** shared research on how rural districts vary on spending, outcomes, and return on investment (ROI). The results are very clustered out. However, there are some "ROI Superstars;" but, after further research, there were no clear answers on what made the difference: no single reform, factor, program, or strategy was identified. There were some patterns that became evident when the ROI Superstars were interviewed: the importance of relationship; implementing flexibility, self-reliance, and ingenuity; making conscious tradeoffs; and respecting costs.

Based on these patterns, certain outcomes were identified: ensure an information system that links spending and outcomes by school; equitably fund students and student types (not inputs, programs, districts, etc.); keep funds flexible; and build adequate revenue streams. Adequate revenue streams can be created through "tapping and taming" local monies, as people would rather vote for money to go to local districts rather than to the state. **Dr. Roza** encouraged legislators to focus on these four things as they design a finance formula for Idaho.

In response to questions, **Dr. Roza** stated that funding accountability is more powerful at the local level, with districts examining their local data. As for the state level, it works best if the data is looked at over several years, and then the state makes judgments based on spending and outcome ROI.

In response to questions on how the "tap and tame" approach could be used when there are constitutional requirements in place, like in Idaho, **Dr. Roza** stated that legislators can approach "tap and tame" through further defining what constitutes state responsibility. The key takeaway is for legislators to look at the data numbers as they are examining their full suite of options.

**Sen. Winder** asked what options existed for better teacher retention. **Dr. Roza** stated it is important for individual districts to discover what options work best for their own districts, rather than a generalized plan. In response to a question on the effectiveness of master teacher program efficiency, **Dr. Roza** stated research showed state mandatory programs were not positive—district-oriented programs were much more positive.

**Dr. Roza** stated that money flexibility allows for districts to explore their options and evaluate how to best allocate funds.

**Chairmen Mortimer** thanked **Dr. Roza** for her time.

**ADJOURN:** There being no further business to come before the Joint Committees, **Chairmen Mortimer** dismissed the House Education Committee at 4:12 pm.

---

Representative VanOrden  
Chair

---

Shelby Winkel  
Secretary